

## Random graphs 29

Now let us consider the case where  $p$  is large as compared to  $t$ , i.e.  $\gamma \rightarrow \infty$ .

Here we will work with another threshold function and then will easily convince ourselves that this other threshold function also works in Lemma 7.15.

Let  $\mathcal{E}'(H) := \max \{ \mathcal{E}(H') : H' \subseteq H \}$   
↳ is a subgraph of "

Lemma 7.16 If  $t = n^{-1/\mathcal{E}'(H)}$  and  $p$  is such that  $\gamma = \frac{p}{t} \rightarrow \infty$ , then almost every  $G \in \mathcal{G}(n, p)$  lies in  $\mathcal{P}_H$ .

Proof  $\gamma = \frac{p}{t} \rightarrow \infty \Rightarrow p = \gamma \cdot t = \gamma n^{-1/\mathcal{E}'}$  with  $\mathcal{E}' := \mathcal{E}'(H)$ .

We will use the following inequality:

$$\begin{aligned} \forall n \geq k \quad \binom{n}{k} n^{-k} &= \frac{1}{k!} \frac{n(n-1)\dots(n-k+1)}{n^k} = \\ &= \frac{1}{k!} \frac{n}{n} \cdot \frac{n-1}{n} \dots \frac{n-k+1}{n} \geq \frac{1}{k!} \left( \frac{n-k+1}{n} \right)^k \\ &\geq \frac{1}{k!} \left( 1 - \frac{k-1}{n} \right)^k \end{aligned}$$

$1 - \frac{k-1}{n} \geq 1 - \frac{k-1}{k}$

Thus for  $k$  fixed and  $n$  large

$$\binom{n}{k} \geq \frac{1}{k!} \left( 1 - \frac{k-1}{n} \right)^k n^k = c_k n^k \quad (\text{****})$$

and  $c_k$  is independent of  $n$ !

Random graphs 30

Now we want to use Lemma 7.13, so we try to bound  $\frac{\sigma^2}{\mu^2} = \frac{E(x^2) - \mu^2}{\mu^2}$  (with  $\mu = E(x)$ ) from above.

Rewrite  $x^2$  as follows:

$$x^2(G) = |\{H \in \mathcal{H} : H \subseteq G\}|^2 = |\{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2 : H' \subseteq G \text{ and } H'' \subseteq G\}|$$

Now compute  $E(x^2)$  (by double counting):

$$E(x^2) = \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2} P[H' \subseteq G \text{ and } H'' \subseteq G] = \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G] \quad (*)$$

$$|E(H' \cup H'')| = 2\ell - |E(H' \cap H'')|$$

Consider now  $P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G] = p$

because  $|E(H' \cup H'')| = \underbrace{|E(H')|}_{=\ell} + \underbrace{|E(H'')|}_{=\ell} - |E(H' \cap H'')| = 2\ell - |E(H' \cap H'')|$  since  $H', H'' \in \mathcal{H}$

But  $|E(H' \cap H'')| = \underbrace{|V(H' \cap H'')|}_{\leq i} \cdot \underbrace{\epsilon(H' \cap H'')}_{\leq \epsilon'}$   $\therefore |E(H' \cap H'')| \leq i \epsilon'$

$\epsilon(H' \cap H'')$  is a graph with vertex set  $V(H') \cap V(H'')$  and edge set  $E(H') \cap E(H'')$

This inequality is due to the fact that  $H' \in \mathcal{H}, H'' \in \mathcal{H} \Rightarrow H' \cap H''$  is isomorphic to a subgraph of  $H$ , hence  $|E(H' \cap H'')| \leq \epsilon'(H)$ .

Thus we get  $P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G] \leq p^{2\ell - \epsilon' i}$  (\*\*\*)

# Random graphs 31

Rewrite the sum in (\*):

$$E(X^2) = \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G] = \sum_{i=0}^k \sum_{\substack{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2 \\ |H' \cap H''| = i}} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G]$$

$(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}_i^2$  
 $(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}_i^2$  (\*\*\*)

Let  $\mathcal{H}_i^2 := \{ (H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2 : |H' \cap H''| = i \}$ ,  $i \in \overline{0, k}$

and  $A_i := \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}_i^2} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G]$ .

So (\*\*\*) becomes  $E(X^2) = \sum_{i=0}^k A_i$  ~~(\*\*\*\*)~~

If  $i=0$   $(H' \cap H'' = \emptyset) \Rightarrow V(H') \cap V(H'') = \emptyset \Rightarrow$

the events  $H' \subseteq G$ ,  $H'' \subseteq G$  are independent  $\Rightarrow$

$$A_0 = \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}_0^2} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G] = \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}_0^2} P[H' \subseteq G] P[H'' \subseteq G]$$

$p^e$        $p^e$

$$\leq \sum_{(H', H'') \in \mathcal{H}^2} P[H' \subseteq G] P[H'' \subseteq G] =$$

$$= \underbrace{\sum_{H' \in \mathcal{H}} P[H' \subseteq G]}_{E(X) = p} \underbrace{\sum_{H'' \in \mathcal{H}} P[H'' \subseteq G]}_{E(X) = p} = p^2$$

Next we estimate  $A_i$  for  $i \geq 1$ .

Rewrite  $A_i = \sum_{H', H'' \in \mathcal{H}_i^2} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G] = \sum_{H' \in \mathcal{H}} \sum_{\substack{H'' \in \mathcal{H} \\ |H' \cap H''| = i}} P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G]$

$H'' = \overset{0 \dots 0}{\dots} \overset{1 \dots 1}{\dots} \overset{1 \dots 1}{\dots}$

For a fixed  $H'$  the second sum has  $\binom{k}{i} \binom{n-k}{k-i} p^k$  summands = # graphs  $H'' \in \mathcal{H}$  with  $|V(H' \cap H'')| = i$

So  $\forall i \geq 1$  we get

$$\begin{aligned}
 \underline{A_i} &= \sum_{H' \in \mathcal{H}} \sum_{\substack{H'' \in \mathcal{H}: \\ |H' \cap H''| = i}} \underbrace{P[H' \cup H'' \subseteq G]}_{p^{2l-i\epsilon'}} \stackrel{(\ast\ast\ast)}{\leq} \sum_{H' \in \mathcal{H}} \binom{k}{i} \binom{n-k}{k-i} h p^{2l-i\epsilon'} \\
 &= |\mathcal{H}| \binom{k}{i} \binom{n-k}{k-i} h p^{2l} \underbrace{\left(\gamma^{m-1/\epsilon'}\right)^{-i\epsilon'}}_{\gamma^t} \leq \\
 &\leq |\mathcal{H}| p^e \underbrace{c_1 m^{k-i}}_{n_i} h p^e \gamma^{-i\epsilon'} \quad \text{with } c_1 = \binom{k}{i} \frac{1}{(k-i)!} \\
 &= \mu = E(X) \\
 &= \mu c_1 n^k h p^e \gamma^{-i\epsilon'} \leq \\
 &\stackrel{(\ast\ast\ast\ast)}{\leq} \mu c_2 \binom{n}{k} h p^e \gamma^{-i\epsilon'} \quad \text{with } c_2 = c_1 / c_k \\
 &= \mu^2 c_2 \gamma^{-i\epsilon'} \leq \underline{\mu^2 c_2 \gamma^{-\epsilon'}} \quad (\text{if } \gamma \geq 1)
 \end{aligned}$$

und  $(n-k)_{k-i} \leq (n-k)^{k-i} \leq m^{k-i}$   
 Observe:  $c_1$  independent on  $n_i$ !  
 also  $c_2$  is independent on  $n_i$   
 since  $c_k$  is independent of  $n_i$

Summarizing we obtain from  $(\ast\ast\ast\ast)$

$$E(X^2) = \sum_{i=0}^k A_i = A_0 + \sum_{i=1}^k A_i \leq \mu^2 + \sum_{i=1}^k \mu^2 c_2 \gamma^{-\epsilon'}$$

and  $\frac{\sigma^2}{\mu^2} = \frac{E(X^2) - \mu^2}{\mu^2} \leq \sum_{k=1}^k c_2 \gamma^{-\epsilon'} = k c_2 \gamma^{-\epsilon'} = c_3 \gamma^{-\epsilon'}$

$c_3$  indep on  $n$ !

Finally  $\frac{\sigma^2}{\mu^2} \leq c_3 \gamma^{-\epsilon'} \xrightarrow{\gamma \rightarrow \infty} 0$  (because  $\epsilon' > 0$ )

and lemma 7.14 implies  $P[X > 0] = P[H \neq \emptyset] \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 1$

$\Rightarrow P[X > 0] \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 1$

Theorem 7.17 (Erdős, Rényi 1960, Bollobás 1981)

Let  $H$  be a graph with  $|E(H)| \geq 1$ .

Then  $t = n^{-1|E(H)|}$  is a threshold function for  $\mathcal{P}_H$ .

Proof We have to show:

(1)  $\mathbb{P}[H \subseteq G] \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0$

if  $p$  is such that  $\gamma \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0$

(2)  $\mathbb{P}[H \subseteq G] \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 1$

if  $p$  is such that  $\gamma \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} \infty$

(2) is exactly what is shown in Lemma 7.16

To show (1) consider  $H' \subseteq H$  s.t.  $|E(H')| = |E(H)|$

and apply Lemma 7.15 for  $H'$ :

$\mathbb{P}[H' \subseteq G] \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0$  if  $p$  is such that  $\gamma \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0$  with  $\gamma = \frac{p}{t} = \frac{p}{n^{-1|E(H)|}}$

Finally observe that

$\mathbb{P}[H \subseteq G] \leq \mathbb{P}[H' \subseteq G]$  (because  $H' \subseteq H$ )

and this completes the proof.  $\gamma \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0$   $\square$

Remark: Theorem 7.17 is particularly easy to apply

if  $H$  is such that  $|E(H)| = |V(H)|$ .

Such graphs are called balanced graphs.

Examples of balanced graphs: trees, cycles

Random graphs 34

$$t = n^{-1/\epsilon'}$$

Corollary 7.18 If  $k \geq 3$  then  $t = n^{-1}$  is a threshold

function for the property of containing a  $k$ -cycle.  
 $p = o\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \implies C_k \not\subseteq G \text{ a.s. } m(G(n,p))$   
 $p = \frac{1}{n^{-1+\epsilon}} \implies C_k \subseteq G \text{ a.s. } m(G(n,p))$

Proof: Observe that for every cycle  $C_k$   $\epsilon'(C_k) = 1$  holds. Indeed every <sup>proper</sup> subgraph of a cycle is a collection of paths (may be of length 0, i.e. have 1 vertex and zero edges) And the density of each path is  $\leq 1$  whereas  $\epsilon(C_k) = 1$ . Thus  $\epsilon'(C_k) = 1$ .

According to Th. 7.17 the threshold function for  $\mathcal{P}_{C_k}$  is  $n^{-1/\epsilon'(C_k)} = \frac{1}{n}$

Remark:  $t(n) = \frac{1}{n}$  does not depend on  $k$ !

Corollary 7.19 If  $T$  is a tree with  $|V(T)| = k \geq 2$  then  $t(n) = n^{-\frac{1}{k-1}}$  is a threshold function for

the property of containing an isomorphic copy of  $T$ , i.e.  $T \subseteq G$  or  $G \in \mathcal{P}_T$ .

Proof Observe that  $\epsilon(T) = \frac{k-1}{k}$  if  $|V(T)| = k$ .

Each subgraph of  $T$  is a forest on  $k$  or less vertices; the density of such a subgraph is  $\leq \frac{k-1}{k}$ .

Therefore  $\epsilon'(T) = \epsilon(T) = \frac{k-1}{k}$  and

the corollary follows then directly from Theorem 7.17.

$$-\frac{1}{\epsilon} = -\frac{k}{k-1}$$